

Envisioning Others

*Race, Color, and the Visual in Iberia and
Latin America*

Edited by

Pamela A. Patton



BRILL

LEIDEN | BOSTON

Contents

Acknowledgements	VII
List of Illustrations	VIII
List of Contributors	XII

Introduction: Race, Color, and the Visual in Iberia and Latin America 1

Pamela A. Patton

- 1 The Black Madonna of Montserrat: An Exception to Concepts of Dark Skin in Medieval and Early Modern Iberia? 18
Elisa A. Foster
- 2 Visualizing Black Sanctity in Early Modern Spanish Polychrome Sculpture 51
Erin Kathleen Rowe
- 3 The Color of Salvation: The Materiality of Blackness in Alonso de Sandoval's *De instauranda Aethiopum salute* 83
Grace Harpster
- 4 Imagined Transformations: Color, Beauty, and Black Christian Conversion in Seventeenth-Century Spanish America 111
Larissa Brewer-García
- 5 White or Black? Albinism and Spotted Blacks in the Eighteenth-Century Atlantic World 142
Ilona Katzew
- 6 Making Race Visible in the Colonial Andes 187
Ananda Cohen Suarez
- 7 From *Casta* to *Costumbrismo*: Representations of Racialized Social Spaces 213
Mey-Yen Moriuchi

- 8 **Tropical Dreams: Promoting Brazil in Nineteenth-Century US
Media** 241
 Beatriz E. Balanta
- 9 **The Form of Race: Architecture, Epistemology, and National Identity
in Fernando Chueca Goitia's *Invariantes castizos de la arquitectura
española* (1947)** 266
 Matilde Mateo
- 10 **Race and the Historiography of Colonial Art** 303
 Charlene Villaseñor Black
- Selected Bibliography** 323
- Index** 362

Making Race Visible in the Colonial Andes

Ananda Cohen Suarez

The ‘invention’ of race in colonial Latin America was born out of a necessity for Spaniards to establish power distinctions based on skin color, physiognomy, lineage, dress, and a host of other factors, in order to demarcate themselves from their colonial subjects.¹ Indigenous, African-descended, and mixed race peoples continually pushed the boundaries of racial prescription in their daily lives as a means of asserting agency within a restrictive social hierarchy. Scholars have devoted ample attention to the strategies by which non-European peoples navigated Spanish colonial institutions,

* I would like to thank Ernesto Bassi and Durba Ghosh for their insightful comments and suggestions during the preparation of this essay, as well as Pamela Patton for inviting me to contribute to this volume.

1 The use of the term ‘race’ in the context of colonial Latin America remains a fraught issue that has undergone vigorous debate over the past few decades. ‘Race’ is often seen as an anachronism that carries the baggage of North American perceptions and attitudes of the twenty-first century, thus obscuring the historical particularities of identity construction in colonial Latin America. Some scholars have utilized the term *calidad*, which appears in colonial documentation from the sixteenth to nineteenth centuries, as a way of contextualizing notions of racial difference through the language of the colonial period. The term can help add nuance to our understanding of ‘race’ in this context, highlighting the different variables that marked status in the colonial Americas, including lineage, literacy, residence, clothing, comportment, and profession. When applied to the realm of visual culture, however, the nuances folded into the notion *calidad* often become erased, whereas skin color and physiognomy are emphasized. While I agree that ‘race’ is not calibrated to a colonial Latin American historical conception of the term, I use it in this essay in order to add nuance to the way that we contemplate race in the twenty-first century. In other words, by turning our attention to the specific ways in which artists and viewers participated in the visual codification of identity and difference in the colonial Andes, we can develop a broader understanding of how these concepts have transformed over the course of 400 years and yet retain some surprising and insidious connections to the colonial past both in Latin America and across its global diasporas.

whether through recourse to the legal system or through the practice of self-fashioning that enabled one to 'pass' for a certain ethnicity.²

Racial ideologies were not only deployed within social space, however. They also became codified in the visual realm to produce a seamless normalization of what was, in essence, a violent and arbitrary designation of inequality on non-European peoples. This essay examines the very tools and tropes that artists utilized in "fleshing out" race in a place where it had never before existed or been represented. In other words, how did ideologies of racial difference become transposed onto canvases or the walls of churches? The use of pigments, the delineation of facial features, strategic compositional devices, and the inclusion of ethnically-marked clothing and objects gave visual form to the plethora of linguistic signifiers that began to define the lived conditions of 'Spanishness,' 'Blackness,' 'Indianness,' and their multitudinous intermixtures from the sixteenth century onwards.³

In the colonial Andes, race's visual discourses often served polemical ends, whether in the service of faithfully reproducing or radically dismantling the structures of colonialism. Visual culture across the viceregal Americas participated in imperial projects that sought to construct a harmonious and productive multiracial society. This is perhaps most potently illustrated in *casta* paintings that depict interracial mixture in eighteenth-century Mexico, which were exported to Spain for incorporation into royal and private collections.⁴

2 For two recent anthologies devoted to these issues, see Andrew B. Fisher and Matthew O'Hara, eds., *Imperial Subjects: Race and Identity in Colonial Latin America* (Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 2009); and Laura Gotkowitz, ed., *Histories of Race and Racism: The Andes and Mesoamerica from Colonial Times to the Present* (Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 2011). See also the seminal study by Magnus Mörner upon which much of the present scholarship is based: *Race Mixture in the History of Latin America* (Boston: Little and Brown, 1967). And for recent monographs on the negotiation of status and power among indigenous and mixed-race peoples, see Yanna Yannakakis, *The Art of Being in-Between: Native Intermediaries, Indian Identity, and Local Rule in Colonial Oaxaca* (Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 2008); and Joanne Rappaport, *The Disappearing Mestizo: Configuring Difference in the Colonial New Kingdom of Granada* (Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 2014).

3 Representations of blackness unfortunately fall beyond the scope of this essay. Further research into this underexamined area of inquiry will help to broaden our panorama of racialized depictions in colonial Andean art. For an excellent monograph on relationships between indigenous and Afro-Peruvian communities in coastal Peru, see Rachel Sarah O'Toole, *Bound Lives: Africans, Indians, and the Making of Race in Colonial Peru* (Pittsburgh: University of Pittsburgh Press, 2012).

4 For discussions of *casta* paintings in colonial Mexico, see Magali Carrera, "Locating Race in Late Colonial Mexico," *Art Journal* 57, no. 3 (1998): 36–45; and *Imagining Identity in New Spain: Race, Lineage, and the Colonial Body in Portraiture and Casta Paintings* (Austin: University of

This essay focuses not on images of racial intermixture, however, but on the ways in which visual culture participates in the crystallization of racial categories through representations of difference. In particular, Andean religious imagery of the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries frequently resorted to crude formulas in the representation of race that gained intervisual traction through their appearance across a variety of artworks. Indigenous and white bodies were distributed into a binary of sin and virtue whereby brownness became synonymous with transgression and whiteness served as a domain of divinity. This is not to imply that this binary remained intact across all religious imagery of the colonial Andes. There exist a number of paintings that depict devout Indians engaged in the act of prayer, procession, or showcasing their patronage of religious statues.⁵ What I would like to focus on here, however, is the pervasiveness of this binary in eschatological images where indigenous and white figures share the same pictorial space. Eschatological imagery serves as an important site for the visual deployment of racial difference. Paintings of Hell and the Last Judgment were essential in the conversion process, featuring violent depictions of indigenous bodies suffering or about to suffer an array of tortures for failure to follow a life of piety.⁶ This essay looks at a selection of paintings classified under

Texas Press, 2003); as well as Ilona Katzew and John A. Farmer, eds., *New World Orders: Casta Painting and Colonial Latin America*, trans. Roberto Tejada and Miguel Falomir Faus (New York: Americas Society, 1996); Ilona Katzew, *Casta Painting: Images of Race in Eighteenth-Century Mexico* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 2004); and Susan Deans-Smith, "Creating the Colonial Subject: Casta Paintings, Collectors, and Critics in Eighteenth-Century Mexico and Spain," *Colonial Latin American Review* 14, no. 2 (2005): 169–204. For a discussion of a set of Peruvian *casta* paintings from the eighteenth century, see Juan Carlos Estenssoro, Pilar Romero de Tejada y Picatoste, and Luis Eduardo Wuffarden, *Los cuadros de mestizaje del Virrey Amat: la representación etnográfica en el Perú Colonial* (Lima: Museo de Arte de Lima, 2000).

- 5 See, for instance, Carolyn Dean, *Inka Bodies and the Body of Christ: Corpus Christi in Colonial Cuzco, Peru* (Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 1999); Emily A. Engel, "Visualizing a Colonial Peruvian Community in the Eighteenth-Century Paintings of Our Lady of Cocharcas," *Religion and the Arts* 13, no. 3 (2009): 299–339; and Maya Stanfield-Mazzi, "Cult, Countenance, and Community: Donor Portraits from the Colonial Andes," *Religion and the Arts* 15, no. 4 (2011): 429–459.
- 6 Teresa Gisbert has written extensively on this topic, although her discussion focuses more on indigenous identity and cultural practice rather than the issue of race. See Teresa Gisbert, "La muerte en el arte virreinal andino," in *Al final del camino*, ed. Luis Millones and Sidea Moisés Lemlij (Lima: Sidea Fondo Editorial, 1996), 102–115; *eadem*, "El Anticristo en la pintura virreinal," *Latin American Literary Review*, no. 52 (1998): 214–224; and Teresa Gisbert and Andrés de Mesa, "Los grabados, el 'Juicio Final' y la idolatría indígena en el mundo andino," in *Entre cielos e infiernos. Memoria del V Encuentro Internacional sobre Barroco*, ed. Norma Campos

the rubric of *postrimerías* (the Four Last Things) from the southern Andes (modern-day Peru and Bolivia) produced between the seventeenth and early nineteenth centuries to gain a sense of the ways in which racial difference was mapped onto a Manichean terrain of good and evil, the saved and the damned.⁷

From Incas to Indios

Indigenous peoples of the Andes became transformed (and transformed themselves) into ‘indios,’ a catchall racial status and economic category invented by the Spanish colonial administration to exert control over a vast population comprised of a multitude of ethnic groups.⁸ Terms such as *indio tributario* (tributary Indian), *curaca* or *cacique* (local indigenous ruler), *colla* (elite indigenous woman), *cholo* (city-dwelling Indian), or *indio ladino* (Hispanicized Indian) all served as qualifiers for an identity imposed on indigenous bodies set along a continuum of economic and political power. A number of scholars have demonstrated the relative fluidity of ‘Indianness’ in the colonial period, pointing to the ways that indigenous people modified their dress, language, and behavior as a means of asserting a particular identity.⁹

Vera (La Paz: Fundación Visión Cultural, 2010), 17–42. See also Santiago Sebastián, *El barroco iberoamericano. Mensaje iconográfico*. (Madrid: Encuentro, 1990); and Ramón Mujica Pinilla, “Hell in the Andes: The Last Judgment in the Art of Viceregal Peru,” in *Contested Visions in the Spanish Colonial World*, ed. Ilona Katzew (Los Angeles: Los Angeles County Museum of Art, 2011), 177–202.

- 7 This analysis is by no means intended to provide a comprehensive account of all Andean eschatological imagery or posit that every colonial painting of this subject matter possesses these binaries. Indeed, some depictions of Hell and the Last Judgment contain no references to racial difference at all and there are others that do not necessarily correspond to the binaries described here. What I would like to demonstrate, however, are the broad continuities in the codification of indigeneity and whiteness in colonial visual culture of the Andes, and the ways in which these racialized representations become entangled with notions of sin and redemption.
- 8 For a discussion of ethnicity in the Inca empire, see Teresa Gisbert, “La muerte en el arte virreinal andino;” eadem, “El Anticristo en la pintura virreinal;” and Gisbert and de Mesa, “Los grabados, el Juicio Final y la idolatría indígena en el mundo andino.”
- 9 See in particular Jane E. Mangan, “A Market of Identities: Women, Trade, and Ethnic Labels in Colonial Potosí,” in *Imperial Subjects: Race and Identity in Colonial Latin America*, ed. Andrew B. Fisher and Matthew D. O’Hara (Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 2009), 61–80; and David Tavárez, “Legally Indian: Inquisitorial Readings of Indigenous Identity in New Spain,” in *Imperial Subjects: Race and Identity in Colonial Latin America*, ed. Andrew B. Fisher and Matthew D. O’Hara (Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 2009), 81–100. The pioneering work of Rolena Adorno has contributed to our understanding of how the seventeenth-century

Taking on the identity of 'Indian' could also be read as a performative act for navigating the colonial legal system, as Rachel O'Toole points out.¹⁰ With the conquest and colonization of Spanish South America in the sixteenth century, the terrain of indigeneity transformed from a variegated mosaic of ethnicities and linguistic groups to a flattened notion of the *indio* in which only a circumscribed spectrum of options existed to which indigenous-labeled Andean peoples could aspire. In particular, legal petitions for elite status submitted by a variety of indigenous subjects as descendants of Inca kings has received substantial scholarly attention as a means by which Andeans could enjoy special privileges such as exemption from tribute obligations.¹¹ Nevertheless, for the vast majority of indigenous people, *indio* served as the primary category within which Andeans of indigenous descent operated.

indigenous chronicler Felipe Guaman Poma de Ayala asserted agency as an *indio ladino*, or indigenous person with access to Spanish institutions and cultural practices. See especially "The Indigenous Ethnographer: The 'Indio Ladino' as Historian and Cultural Mediation," in *Implicit Understandings: Observing, Reporting and Reflecting on the Encounters between Europeans and Other Peoples in the Early Modern Era*, ed. Stuart B. Schwartz (Cambridge and New York: Cambridge University Press, 1994), 378–402. A number of scholars have also explored the specific means by which indigenous peoples used literacy as a way of participating in the Spanish colonial culture of letters. See Alcira Dueñas, *Indians and Mestizos in the Lettered City: Reshaping Justice, Social Hierarchy, and Political Culture in Colonial Peru* (Boulder: University Press of Colorado, 2010); and Joanne Rappaport and Thomas B.F. Cummins, *Beyond the Lettered City: Indigenous Literacies in the Andes* (Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 2012).

10 O'Toole, *Bound Lives*, 66.

11 See, for instance, John Charles, *Allies at Odds: The Andean Church and Its Indigenous Agents, 1583–1671* (Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 2010); Karen Spalding, *Huarocharí, An Andean Society under Inca and Spanish Rule* (Stanford: Stanford University, 1984); Steve J. Stern, *Peru's Indian Peoples and the Challenge of Spanish Conquest: Huamanga to 1640*, 2nd ed. (Madison: University of Wisconsin Press, 1993); John V. Murra, "Litigation over the Rights of 'Natural Lords' in Early Colonial Courts in the Andes," in *Native Traditions in the Postconquest World*, ed. Elizabeth Hill Boone and Thomas Cummins, (Washington, DC: Dumbarton Oaks, 1998), 55–62; Jacques Poloni-Simard, "Los indios ante la justicia. El pleito como parte de la consolidación de la sociedad colonial," in *Máscaras, tretas y rodeos del discurso colonial en los Andes*, ed. Bernard Lavallé (Lima: Instituto Francés de Estudios Andinos, 2005), 177–188; Jeremy Mumford, "Aristocracy on the Auction Block: Race, Lords, and the Perpetuity Controversy of Sixteenth-Century Peru," in *Imperial Subjects: Race and Identity in Colonial Latin America*, ed. Andrew B. Fisher and Matthew D. O'Hara (Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 2009), 35–59; and José Carlos de la Puente Luna, "The Many Tongues of the King: Indigenous Language Interpreters and the Making of the Spanish Empire," *Colonial Latin American Review* 23, no. 2 (2014): 143–170.

The Inca empire, which by standard accounts was founded around 1438 and conquered by the Spanish less than a century later in 1532, encompassed a multiethnic and multilingual populace of nearly 10 million inhabitants distributed along the 2500 mile-long Andes mountain chain. The Incas instituted their own strategies of linguistic and ethnic homogenization by naming Quechua the lingua franca of the empire and through the forced dispersal of ethnic groups into what were known as *mitmaq* settlements.¹² The imposition of Spanish rule, however, involved the attempted erasure of interethnic distinctions among nearly all indigenous people, who became inserted into the one-size-fits-all invented category of Indian.¹³ The label 'indio' conjured a plethora of negative associations. It was forcibly conflated with inferiority, depravity, ignorance, indolence, and all of their points of intersection. At the same time that *indio* connoted a set of behaviors that threatened to undermine the success of the Spanish colonial enterprise, it also implied possibility for improvement. Spanish taxonomies stipulated that four generations of Indian intermarriage with Spaniards would result in 'pure' Spanish progeny.¹⁴ This notion of Indians as possessing the capacity for racial improvement dovetailed with concurrent beliefs around their capacity for conversion that were first brought into public discourse through the widely published debate between Bartolomé de las Casas and Juan Ginés de Sepúlveda in 1550–51.¹⁵ The term was

12 *Mitmaq* were ethnic populations that were relocated from their ancestral lands but still retained ties to their home communities. For a discussion of *mitmaq* in the central highlands of Peru, see Karen Spalding, *Huarochirí*, 36–44.

13 But despite Spanish attempts to eliminate ethnic solidarity among indigenous peoples in the Andes, particularly through resettlement projects of the sixteenth century, a number of scholars have demonstrated the persistence and reformulation of intra-indigenous divisions through the rubrics of kin, ethnicity, geography, and nation. See, for instance, Steve J. Stern, *Peru's Indian Peoples and the Challenge of Spanish Conquest: Huamanga to 1640* (Madison: University of Wisconsin Press, 1982); Cahill, "Colour by Numbers"; Donato Amado Gonzáles, "El alferez real de los incas: resistencia, cambios y continuidad de la identidad indígena," in *Incas e indios cristianos. Elites indígenas e identidades cristianas en los Andes coloniales*, ed. Jean-Jacques Decoster (Cuzco: Centro de Estudios Regionales Andinos Bartolomé de Las Casas, 2002), 221–251; and Steven A. Wernke, *Negotiated Settlements: Andean Communities and Landscapes Under Inka and Spanish Colonialism* (Gainesville, FL: University Press of Florida, 2013).

14 For further discussion, see Katzew, *Casta Painting*, 48–51.

15 The Las Casas and Sepúlveda debate centered on whether indigenous people of the New World should be classified as "natural slaves" within an Aristotelian rubric. The life and writings of Bartolomé de las Casas have been elaborated at length by scholars. See most recently Lawrence A. Clayton, *Bartolomé de Las Casas: A Biography* (Cambridge and New York: Cambridge University Press, 2012).

also tied to labor; Indians were required to pay tribute in compensation for their protection under the crown. The term *indio*, then, indicated legal, ethnic, and economic status.

At the same time that the notion of the Indian was being defined as an instrument of the Spanish colonial administration, it was also becoming visually articulated for the very first time. Hundreds of prints depicting New World Amerindians circulated throughout Europe, from De Bry's famous engravings from his *Voyages* series (1590–1634) to Hans Burgkmair's fanciful renderings of Tupinamba Indians. The emergence of an interconnected print culture dedicated to illustrating the Americas and its inhabitants satisfied European desires for envisioning a world to which most would never have access.¹⁶ These images rarely circulated back into the Americas, however, thus constituting a visual archive of the New World Indian that appeared quite different from representations produced for local patrons and spectators.

Scholars have made considerable inroads in demonstrating how indigenous Andeans were granted pictorial form by artists working in the Viceroyalty of Peru.¹⁷ Studies of eighteenth-century portraits of indigenous elites in particular have shed light on the complexities of Andean self-fashioning.¹⁸ These paintings, as art historian Carolyn Dean has argued, appropriated the European visual rhetoric of the portrait as a means to assert indigenous claims to power. Their depiction of both Christian and Inca regalia and symbols reflected the role of indigenous elites as intermediaries between their constituent communities and the Spanish colonial administration.¹⁹ The portraits reflect a

16 See, for instance, Hugh Honour, *The New Golden Land: European Images of America from The Discoveries to the Present Time* (New York: Pantheon Books, 1975); Jean Michel Massing, "Early European Images of America: The Ethnographic Approach," in *Circa 1492: Art in the Age of Exploration*, ed. Jay A. Levenson (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1992), 515–518; and Jill Burke, "Nakedness and Other Peoples: Rethinking the Italian Renaissance Nude," *Art History* 36, no. 4 (2013): 722–726.

17 The Viceroyalty of Peru was an administrative district founded in 1542. At its height, it encompassed all of Spanish-controlled South America, although by the late colonial period, the territory was further subdivided into the Viceroyalties of Nueva Granada (founded in 1717) and Rio de la Plata (founded in 1776).

18 Thomas B.F. Cummins, "We Are the Other: Peruvian Portraits of Colonial Kurakakuna," in *Transatlantic Encounters: Europeans and Andeans in the Sixteenth Century*, ed. Kenneth J. Andrien and Rolena Adorno (Los Angeles and Berkeley: University of California Press, 1991), 203–270; Carolyn Dean, "Inka Nobles: Portraiture and Paradox in Colonial Peru," in *Exploring New World Imagery: Spanish Colonial Papers from the 2002 Mayer Center Symposium*, ed. Donna Pierce (Denver: Denver Art Museum, 2005), 80–103.

19 Dean, "Inka Nobles," 96–97.

desire to establish continuity between the Inca past and colonial present while also stressing the individual's identity as a devout Catholic. Cordoned off from the rest of colonial society, portraits of Inca royal descendants existed in a decontextualized space that enabled the viewer to contemplate the physiognomic likeness of the sitter without distraction. The singularity of the portrait seemed to place the sitter in a privileged pictorial plane hermetically sealed off from the multiracial worlds that native elites were expected to mediate. In these portraits, the embodiment of an indigenous identity remains uncontested by their very nature: as painted likenesses of named individuals situated within a compressed space emptied of any direct references to the broader society to which they belonged. While noble Inca portraits reveal multitudes about the role of native elites as political and cultural intermediaries between their constituent peasant communities and the Spanish colonial bureaucracy, they remain mute on the ways that the amorphous category of Indian was forced into existence through the active construction of difference.

In order to better understand artistic formulations of 'Indianness' one must engage in a corresponding inquiry into ideologies of 'Whiteness' or 'Spanishness' against which it was defined. Caste distinctions were upheld by a robust legal apparatus that controlled the lived experiences of colonial subjects.²⁰ The fluidity of racial categories in Spanish America is therefore tempered with powerful material consequences for individuals who embodied particular *casta* categories, especially those in the lower rungs of the colonial social order. The 'flattening' of colonial identities occurred among Iberian immigrant populations as well. Madrileños, Sevillanos, or Granadinos who came to the Americas became transformed into the all-encompassing labels of 'Español' (Spaniard), 'Criollo' (American-born Spaniard), or 'Chapetón' (peninsular-born Spaniard). By the late eighteenth century, as Sinclair Thomson has noted, these categories became even further distilled into 'gente blanco' (white people) or the derogatory 'blanquillos' (whiteys) and 'pukakunka' (rednecks) within the polarized logic of Indian insurgency.²¹ Over the course of a few generations of settlement

20 See Andrew B. Fisher and Matthew O'Hara, "Introduction: Racial Identities and Their Interpreters in Colonial Latin America," in *Imperial Subjects: Race and Identity in Colonial Latin America*, ed. Andrew B. Fisher and Matthew O'Hara (Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 2009), 1–38.

21 Sinclair Thomson, "Was There Race in Colonial Latin America? Identifying Selves and Others in the Insurgent Andes," in *Histories of Race and Racism: The Andes and Mesoamerica from Colonial Times to the Present*, ed. Laura Gotkowitz (Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 2011), 80.

in the Americas, Iberian regional identities tended to dissipate as Spanish-descended peoples in the Americas became reconfigured into new colonial hierarchies.

One may thus conclude that Spaniards and Indians alike were subjected to a type of social and racial systematization that denied the articulation of heterogeneous identities to both parties. The missing ingredient here, of course, is power. The cultural violence that accompanied the transformation of indigenous people into vassals of the Spanish crown in no way matches the experiences of Iberian-descended peoples in the Americas, who benefited from the privilege of 'citizenship' within the Spanish colonial system that granted them exclusive entry into certain offices and professions.²² Whiteness and its implied analogues (Spanish, Catholic) became the gold standard by which racial otherness was defined. In the sixteenth and seventeenth centuries, the project of making race visible in the colonial Andes entailed the normalization of whiteness as a stable, impermeable category, which thereby located brownness or Indianness within the domain of instability and danger. By the late eighteenth century, however, the visual and rhetorical spaces of damnation normally reserved for the Incas and their colonial descendants were often replaced by sinning Spaniards. The Indianness/Whiteness binary thus does not become fundamentally challenged or dismantled by the late colonial period, but simply reversed. The historical backdrop of ethnic conflict and anticolonial political action provides a lens through which to interpret these representational shifts, a point to which we will return later in this essay.

Objects and Otherness: The Material Culture of Indigenous Sin

Urpus and Uncus at the Church of Andahuaylillas

The church of San Pedro de Andahuaylillas, located southeast of Cuzco in the Quispicanchi Province, contains a stunning decorative program of seventeenth-century mural paintings, *retablos* (altarpieces), polychrome sculpture, and canvas paintings that have earned it revered status as one of the most treasured colonial churches in the Andes. In particular, the dramatic entrance wall mural featuring the paths to Heaven and Hell has received substantial attention in the scholarly literature (Fig. 6.1).²³ Painted in the 1620s by the *criollo*

²² See Rappaport, *The Disappearing Mestizo*, 8.

²³ For art historical analyses of the artistic program at the church of Andahuaylillas, see Pál Kelemen, "Two Village Churches of the Andes," *Magazine of Art* 44, no. 5 (1951): 186–189; Pál Kelemen, *Baroque and Rococo in Latin America* (New York: Macmillan, 1951), 174–175;



FIGURE 6.1 *Luis de Riaño and assistants, Camino del cielo e inferno, mural painting, Church of San Pedro de Andahuaylillas, Quispicanchi Province, Cuzco, Peru, ca. 1620s.*

PHOTO BY AUTHOR.

artist Luis de Riaño with the help of assistants, the image presents an allegory of good and bad faith that parishioners would have encountered each time they exited the church. One aspect of the mural program that has escaped the attention of scholars is the faint depiction of indigenous sinners to the left of the church's entrance, on the "Hell" side of the mural (Fig. 6.2). The images are small and easy to overlook, especially if one is viewing a photographic reproduction of the mural; photographs of the entire entrance printed in standard-sized

George Kubler and Martin Soria, *Art and Architecture in Spain and Portugal and Their American Dominions, 1500 to 1800* (Baltimore: Penguin Books, 1959), 322–323; Pablo Macera, "El arte mural cuzqueño, siglos XVI–XX," *Apuntes 2* (1975): 71–72; José de Mesa and Teresa Gisbert, *Historia de la pintura cuzqueña*, vol. 1 (Lima: Fundación Banco Wiese, 1982), 237–238; Jorge Flores Ochoa, Elizabeth Kuon Arce, and Roberto Samanez Argumedo, *Pintura mural en el sur andino* (Lima: Banco de Crédito del Perú, 1993), 66, 138–142; Pablo Macera, *La pintura mural andina, siglos XVI–XIX* (Lima: Editorial Milla Batres, 1993), 33–34, 67–71; Sabine MacCormack, "Art in a Missionary Context: Images from Europe and the Andes in the Church of Andahuaylillas near Cuzco," in *The Word Made Image: Religion, Art, and Architecture in Spain and Spanish America, 1500–1600*, vol. XXVIII, Fenway Court (Boston: Isabella Stewart Gardner Museum, 1998), 103–126; and Ananda Cohen Suarez, "Painting Andean Liminalities at the Church of Andahuaylillas, Cuzco, Peru," *Colonial Latin American Review* 22, no. 3 (2013): 369–399.



FIGURE 6.2 Detail, *Luis de Riaño and assistants, Camino del infierno*.
PHOTO BY AUTHOR.

books render these details nearly invisible. Yet in person, these images are difficult to ignore because they are located right above eye level – undoubtedly a purposeful intervention on the part of one of Riaño’s assistants.

Depicted here is a small scene of native Andeans circumnavigating the waters of Hell. Three men turned straight toward the viewer unwittingly approach the claws of a ferocious Hell mouth on a boat led by a demonic gondolier. Though rendered with little facial detail, the men appear to encompass a spectrum of indigenous identities. The man situated at center wears an *uncu* (tunic) decorated with two registers of *tocapu*, or geometric designs woven into Inca garments. His Inca-style haircut of short bangs and *balcarrotas* (side-locks) also suggest his elite indigenous status. Two brown-skinned men flank the central figure. Their facial hair, cropped haircut, and European-style shirts, by contrast, suggest that they are either mestizos or *indios ladinos*.

Naked Indians are strewn throughout the rest of the scene. Three appear to the left of the path to Hell with their arms raised. Another has fallen straight

into the maws of the Hell mouth. And finally, a naked man wearing the same haircut with *balcarrotas* receives copious amounts of liquid poured directly into his mouth by a masked figure. The brownish color of the beverage and the aryballos-shaped vessel from which it is poured (known by the Incas as an *urpu*) immediately identify it as *chicha* (fermented corn beer). While the scene is uniquely geared toward an Andean audience, it bears strong visual parallels with medieval and early modern images of victims being forced to drink molten lead.²⁴ Indeed, this trope also made its way into illustrations of the Spanish conquest of the Americas, such as in Theodor de Bry's famous 1594 engraving depicting Indians pouring molten gold into the mouths of the Spaniards as punishment for their insatiable lust for the Americas' most lucrative resource.²⁵

These individuals are visually marked as occupying fundamentally different bodies from their white counterparts walking along the path to Heaven. Angels carefully scoop up the white figures that have fallen into its waters. Notably absent in this section of the mural is any depiction of a brown-skinned figure. The waters beneath the path to Hell, by contrast, do not feature any depictions of white-skinned people, thus providing a polemical image of sanctity and sin that corresponds with clearly marked racial boundaries. Objects, hair, and skin color participate in the ethnic demarcation of these individuals as essentialized 'others.' The individuals walking along the path to Heaven, whose pale skin blends almost perfectly with their white garments, possess no objects and wear little clothing, further driving home the importance of forsaking worldly objects in order to attain salvation. The brown skin of the indigenous figures in the Hell section of the mural matches seamlessly with that of the demons, from whom they are differentiated only by their curled tails, snouts, and horns.

Aside from skin color, two items in particular stand out as vehicles for 'racing' these subjects as indigenous: the *urpu* and the *uncu*. Both items intimately engage with the body; the *uncu* envelops the body in woven cloth, while the *urpu* serves as the transfer point through which liquids enter the body – particularly in this image where the *chicha* is poured directly from the large ceramic vessel into the person's mouth. When taken together, the overarching message seems to be that indigenous objects pervade the body with sin,

24 These representations have even been corroborated with scientific evidence. See F.R.W. van de Groot, R.L. ten Berge, and R. Vos, "Historical Perspectives: Molten Gold was Poured Down his Throat Until his Bowels Burst," *Journal of Clinical Pathology* 56, no. 157 (2003): 157.

25 For further discussion, see Cristina González, "Vespasiano in America: Conquistadors, Gold, Anti-Semitism, and the Spanish Black Legend," *Journal of Medieval Iberian Studies* 6, no. 2 (2014): 237–250. For a digital image of de Bry's engraving, see <http://digital.lib.uh.edu/collection/p15195coll39/item/79> (accessed February 15, 2015).

inside and out. Removal of sin does not merely entail eliminating a layer of clothing, as it also enters into one's mouth, throat, and bodily organs. Because of this, ecclesiastical officials sought comprehensive measures to destroy both the instruments of 'idolatry' and the behaviors and beliefs they inspired.

Indigenous peoples were exempted from the Holy Office of the Inquisition due to their status as neophytes. It was of critical importance, then, that sermons, religious texts, and images provided persuasive statements on the dangers of native idolatry. These images were also tied up in Spanish imperial aspirations. As Ramón Mujica Pinilla and Kenneth Mills have argued, the visual and rhetorical construction of the idolatrous Indian served as a tool for justifying continued Spanish presence in the Americas.²⁶ At around the same time that the Andahuaylillas murals were produced, priests were in the throes of a major campaign to eradicate indigenous religious practice known as the *extirpaciones de las idolatrías*, or extirpation of idolatries.²⁷ These campaigns were conducted primarily in the archdiocese of Lima during the early seventeenth century, leaving behind a rich documentary record in the form of published reports and sermons that circulated throughout the viceroyalty. Some of the most well known texts on idolatry include Pablo José de Arriaga's *Extirpacion de la idolatria del piru* (1621), Francisco de Avila's *Tratado de los evangelios* (1648), Fernando de Avendaño's *Sermones de los misterios de nuestra santa fe* (1648), and Pedro de Villagómez's *Carta pastoral* (1649).²⁸ The authors identify a litany of Andean objects that needed to be destroyed and wiped

26 See Mujica Pinilla, "Hell in the Andes: The Last Judgment in the Art of Viceregal Peru," 199; Kenneth Mills, *Idolatry and Its Enemies: Colonial Andean Religion and Extirpation, 1640–1750* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1997); Kenneth Mills, "Religious Imagination in the Viceroyalty of Peru," in *The Virgin, Saints, and Angels: South American Paintings 1600–1825 from the Thoma Collection*, ed. Suzanne Stratton Pruitt (Milan: Skira, 2006), 26–39; and Kenneth Mills, "The Naturalization of Andean Christianities," in *The Cambridge History of Christianity: Reform and Expansion, 1500–1660. Vol 6. Reform and Expansion*, ed. R. Po-chia Hsia (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2007), 508–539.

27 For further discussion, see Pierre Duviols, ed., *Cultura andina y represión: procesos y visitas de idolatrías y hechicerías, Cajatambo, siglo XVII* (Archivos de Historia Andina, 5) (Cuzco: Centro de Estudios Rurales Andinos "Bartolomé de las Casas," 1986); Mills, *Idolatry and Its Enemies*.

28 Pablo José de Arriaga, *Extirpacion de la idolatria del piru* (Lima: Geronymo de Contreras, 1621); Francisco de Avila, *Tratado de los euangelios*, 2 vols. (Lima: Pedro de Cabrera, 1648); Avendaño, *Sermones de los misterios*; Pedro de Villagómez, *Carta pastoral de exortacion e instruccion contra las idolatrias de los indios del arzobispado de Lima* (Lima: Jorge Lopez de Herrera, 1649).

from the cultural memory of indigenous communities, including *huacas* (shrines), *conopas* (figurines), *mamasaras* (objects dedicated to the corn goddess), and *mallquis* (mummified ancestors).

Perhaps unsurprisingly, *chicha* figures prominently as a devilish substance whose consumption stymied conversion efforts. While drunkenness in general was looked upon with disdain, *chicha* was especially problematic for ecclesiastical officials in the Andes because of its perceived function as a type of “gateway drug” to idolatrous behavior. Francisco de Avila, for instance, poses the following questions in his sermon for the fifth Sunday after Epiphany:

How many times, having heard the sermon, do you go to your house and say, from now on I will amend my ways and abhor all sin, and then later the demon tricks you, making you get drunk with *chicha* or wine, with which you return once again to the bad life, and lose your good thoughts? What is that? It is nothing other than the weeds that the demon has sowed within you, oppressing your good thoughts so that you do not achieve salvation, and so that you don’t go to Heaven.²⁹

The consumption of *chicha* was not only policed among the living, but among the dead as well, underscoring its ability to cross boundaries of drunkenness and idolatry. In his fourth sermon, Fernando de Avendaño exhorts his congregations against the common ritual of feeding *chicha* to *mallquis*. Describing the logical impossibility of ‘feeding’ a deceased body, he states,

if the sun isn’t alive, then how does it eat and drink? And if the Malquis are dead, and their souls are in Hell, how do they drink? If their bodies are rotten, and turned into earth, with what mouth do they eat and drink?.... And if the Malquis ate and drank, then the Spaniards, who want more than you want from your Malquis, would also give them food and drink. But the Spaniards don’t do that, because they know that the Malquis don’t eat or drink.³⁰

29 “Quantas vezes aviendo oydo el sermon, vais a vuestra casa, y dezis; de oy en adelante me he de enmendar, y aborrecer el pecado, y luego el demonio os engaña haziendoo embriagar con *chicha*, ò vino, con que volveis otra vez a la mala vida, y se pierden los buenos pensamientos? Eso que es? No es otra cosa, sino que la maleza, que el demonio à sembrado en vos, oprime vuestros buenos pensamientos, para que no os salveis, ni vais al cielo.” Francisco de Avila, *Tratado de los evangelios que nvestra madre la iglesia nos propone en todo el año* (Lima: Pedro de Cabrera, 1648), 134–135.

30 “si el Sol no tiene vida, como ha de comer, y beber? Y si los Malquis están muertos, y sus almas están en el Infierno, como han de beber, si sus cuerpos están podridos, y hechos

Unlike Avila, who attributes this behavior to the demons who have inhabited the bodies and minds of indigenous Andeans, Avendaño frames the use of *chicha* as a practice that demarcates Indians from Spaniards on the basis of rationality. The Spaniards know better than to 'feed' a deceased person *chicha*. In this case, *chicha* is an abhorrent substance not only because it inspires drunkenness, but because it performs in the service of an irrational mind. The perceived shortcomings of the Indian's consciousness are revealed through an alcoholic beverage wrought by indigenous hands onto and into their bodies, dead or alive.

The figure of the Inca as a whole served as a common trope in the extirpation of idolatries literature, enabling us to establish a web of textual discourses around the *uncu*-wearing individual seated in the boat and other representations like it. The same Fernando de Avendaño mentions in another sermon, "Tell me children...How many Inca kings have gone to hell? Everyone. How many Inca Queens? All of them. Why... [B]ecause they worshiped the devil in *guacas*."³¹ Congregations were expected, then, to see these brown-skinned individuals as part of a tainted lineage from which they, as Christianized Indians, have narrowly managed to escape.

In a different sermon, Avendaño references the differences between Indians and their Inca ancestors:

Tell me son...if you were to make yourself [into whomever you wanted] would you make yourself into a black slave? No, you would make yourself white. Would you make yourself a tributary Indian? Certainly not; you would make yourself into an Inca, who is rich and powerful...³²

Forming part of a broader narrative on God as the maker of all things, this sermon maps out an itinerary of racial possibility in the colonial Andes that operates within a strict framework of black, white, and Indian. The aspirations an

tierra, con que boca han de comer, y beber. No veis esto hombres? Que podéis responder? Que podéis decir? Y si los Malquis comieran, y bebieran, los Españoles, que quieren más que vosotros a sus Malquis, también les dieran de comer, y de beber, pero los Españoles no hacen esto; porque saben, que los Malquis no comen, ni beben," Fernando de Avendaño, *Sermones de los misterios de nuestra santa fe católica, en lengua Castellana, y la general del Inca*, vol. 1 (Lima: Jorge López de Herrera, 1648), 40r.

31 Quoted in Irene Silverblatt, *Modern Inquisitions: Peru and the Colonial Origins of the Civilized World* (Durham: Duke University Press, 2004), 180.

32 "Dime hijo... te hicieras a ti mismo, hicieras te negro, esclavo? No, sino blanco: hicieras te Indio tributario? No por cierto, sino Inca, rico y poderosos..." Fernando de Avendaño, *Sermones de los misterios de nuestra santa fe católica, en lengua Castellana, y la general del Inca*, vol. 1 (Lima: Jorge López de Herrera, 1648), 13v.

individual could hold if given the opportunity to “play God” and fashion himself into an ideal colonial subject are tempered by one’s positionality within this triangulation of races. A black slave could aspire to whiteness; an Indian could aspire to be an Inca. Each of these categories is qualified by an additional indicator of status: a black slave; a tributary Indian; a rich and powerful Inca. Avendaño unabashedly adheres to a colonial logic of race in which only whiteness stands alone – unqualified and self-evident. He also acknowledges the social capital with which Incas were accorded by indigenous congregations. Indeed, he points specifically to the fact that, if given the choice, a tributary Indian would undoubtedly change his status to Inca if given the opportunity. This acknowledgment becomes the very basis for driving home his point that a life of humility and devotion as a tribute-paying *indio* will reap spiritual benefits into perpetuity. The Incas are visually and rhetorically extricated from the past and deposited into the eternal present of Hell. Incas and all who associate with them are deliberately cleaved away from the newly constructed *indios*, whose potential for achieving salvation can now be fully realized.

Hell at the Church of Carabuco

Other paintings construct non-Christianized Andeans as descendant avatars of the Inca, destined to the same fate of eternal suffering. José López de Ríos’s 1684 painting entitled *Hell* located in the church of Carabuco in the La Paz region of Bolivia provides an extensive visual inventory of all things Inca, from *keros* to panpipes (Fig. 6.3).³³ As in the Andahuaylillas murals, certain visual cues work in concert to ‘race’ these individuals as non-Christianized Indians, particularly the objects with which they are represented. Two women in the upper register of the canvas hold an *urpu* and a *kero* and share a toast with a horned devil wearing a blue and white striped *uncu*. *Keros* are flared wooden vessels used for the ritual consumption of *chicha* that continued to be produced by and for indigenous communities throughout the colonial period.³⁴ The indigenous identity of the female figures is further marked through the

33 This painting is part of a larger series of paintings at the church of Carabuco of the Four Last Things. For further discussion of this series, see Teresa Gisbert, *Restauración de cuatro lienzos monumentales “El purgatorio,” “el juicio final,” “el infierno” y “la gloria.” Templo de Carabuco* (La Paz: Dirección Nacional de Conservación y Restauración, 2005); and Astrid Windus, “Putting Things in Order: Material Culture and Religious Communication in the Seventeenth Century Bolivian Altiplano,” in *Image – Object – Performance: Mediality and Communication in Cultural Contact Zones of Colonial Latin America and the Philippines*, ed. Astrid Windus and Crailsheim Eberhard (Münster: Waxmann Verlag, 2013), 241–262.

34 See Jorge Flores Ochoa, Elizabeth Kuon Arce, and Roberto Samanez Argumedo, *Qeros, arte Inka en vasos ceremoniales* (Lima: Banco de Crédito del Perú, 1998); and Thomas B.F.



FIGURE 6.3 José López de Ríos, *El infierno*, oil on canvas, Church of Carabuco, La Paz, Bolivia, 1684.

PHOTO BY HIROSHIGE OKADA; REPRODUCED BY PERMISSION.

representation of a large silver *tupu* (garment pin) fastening one of the women's shawls. The foreshortened perspective and exaggerated scale of the crescent-shaped garment pin draws the viewer's eye to the figure, while the pin points directly toward the pair of *keros*.

Next to them an indigenous couple bears witness to a small musical performance. A horned devil with bells around his calves beats on a drum, while the central musician plays a panpipe with his left hand and beats a drum with his right.³⁵ It is perhaps no coincidence that the two objects that make direct contact with the human body – the *kero* and the panpipe – are held by the left hand, which was associated with the 'sinister' realm. These individuals are not pre-Hispanic Incas. The European-style black hats mark them as contemporary indigenous peoples who continue to adopt aspects of Andean cultural practice. They perhaps occupy the most dangerous space within the evangelizing project for their near replication of an Inca mode of comportment within a contemporary context.³⁶

Cummins, *Toasts with the Inca: Andean Abstraction and Colonial Images on Quero Vessels* (Ann Arbor: University of Michigan Press, 2002).

35 This trope extends far into the pre-Columbian period; illustrations of drummers playing the panpipe can be found in Moche fineline vessels. I would like to thank my student Keely Sarr for pointing this out to me.

36 As Teresa Gisbert and Ramón Mujica Pinilla have pointed out, López de Ríos may have been commissioned to purposely emphasize the idolatry of the Indians by parish priest José de Arellano as proof of his work to suppress native religious practices, which was being called into question through a legal investigation launched by Joan de Eguaraz y

The vignette gives way to a small opening in the band of text where a waft of smoke meanders upwards toward the central drummer, indicating a kind of portal that connects these individuals with the souls of the damned. While a nearby scene of cavorting Spaniards or *criollos* provides a similar cautionary message, they remain protected by an unbroken band of text. The distribution of the text beneath the drummer's feet also reveals a clever intervention on the part of the artist to position these contemporary Incas as destined to the same fate as their ancestors. The passage comes from Matthew 13:44–52, and reads, “mittent eos in caminum ignis: ibi erit fletus, et stridor déntium” (excerpted from the larger passage, “The angels shall go out, and shall separate the wicked from among the just, and *shall cast them into the furnace of fire; there shall be weeping and gnashing of teeth*”). In the painting, López de Ríos depicted the waft of smoke in a key location of the text, placing a large spatial break in the passage so that it reads, “Mittent eos *inca*...minum ignis, ibi... (emphasis mine).” The words “in caminum” become redistributed to read as “inca minum.” The term ‘Inca’ stands out prominently in the painting, positioned precisely below the *kero*-wielding women. The artist has thus cleverly manipulated the Latin text to construct an alternate narrative embedded within the Biblical passage itself about the eternal suffering of their ancestors, albeit in a format that has rendered the original Latin ungrammatically correct. The redistribution of the letters invariably emphasizes the only word that parishioners, who were likely non-literate in Latin and Spanish alike, might have recognized: Inca.

The image and text send a powerful message that conflates Inca objects and the behaviors they engender with inevitable damnation. The various objects with which the indigenous sinners were depicted – a pair of *keros*, a windpipe, drums, and an *urpu* – denote a culturally-specific ‘performance’ of sin that engaged all of the senses. The group of European-descended people depicted to the right, by contrast, features only a guitar. This visual difference suggests a racialization of sin through the depiction of specific clusters of objects and regalia associated with the Inca. In other words, while European sin is depicted through the figures’ bodily proximity and indolence, indigenous sin relies on a material armature of objects and instruments that reinforce an association with the Inca past. Indeed, these very objects often became incorporated into actual public idol-burning spectacles that visually resembled Judgment day,

Pasquier. For further information, see Teresa Gisbert, “Del Cusco a Potosí. La religiosidad del sur andino,” in *El Barroco Peruano*, ed. Ramón Mujica Pinilla, vol. 2 (Lima: Banco de Crédito del Perú, 2003), 80–81; and Mujica Pinilla, “Hell in the Andes: The Last Judgment in the Art of Viceregal Peru,” 194.

thereby mutually reinforcing this pictorial imagery with the practice of idolatry extirpation throughout Peru.³⁷

A consideration of the European print sources that informed both the Andahuaylillas murals and the Carabuco painting underscores the intentional deployment of racial hierarchies in colonial Andean eschatological imagery. Philippe Thomassin's *Last Judgment* (1606) and Hieronymus Wierix's *The Wide and Narrow Roads* (ca. 1600), quite predictably, contain no reference whatsoever to indigenous peoples or to racial difference.³⁸ These prints envision a monoracial Hell, which was fitting for the European audiences for whom they were originally intended. When these prints crossed geographical and cultural boundaries, however, their messages needed to be adapted to an Andean context. These disparities between the paintings and their respective source prints illuminate the visibility of racial construction in the colonial Andes. Indigenous bodies appear in these new compositions where they never existed before, qualifying and contextualizing region-specific notions of racial difference through a dual attention to physiognomy and material culture. The seeming indivisibility of sin, skin, and object formed a triumvirate of signs that marked certain Andean peoples as 'other.' While European-descended people also share space with indigenous sinners in these compositions, their representation does not rely on visual articulations of difference. Depictions of European sin do not follow any standard protocol or iconographic tropes. Most significantly, these depictions do not serve as stand-ins for whiteness as a whole; they represented a normalized sin that remained untethered to race or ethnicity. Europeans, after all, were not the primary targets of ecclesiastical intervention in colonial Latin America. As such, the codification of the European sinner did not carry any significant political utility until the late eighteenth century.

Racial Inversions

The Baptism of Christ at the Church of Pitumarca

What happens when indigenous Andeans appear not as idolaters or Christianized neophytes but as critical actors in the staging of Biblical scenes?

37 Mújica Pinilla, "Hell in the Andes: The Last Judgment in the Art of Viceregal Peru," 186–187.

38 These images can be accessed via the online database, PESSCA: Project on the Engraved Sources of Spanish Colonial Art. For Thomassin's engraving, see <http://colonialart.org/artworks/939A>. For the Wierix engraving, see <http://colonialart.org/archives/locations/peru/departamento-de-cusco/ciudad-de-andahuaylillas/iglesia-de-san-pedro#c124a-124b> (accessed February 19, 2015).

Pablo Gamarra's 1777 mural painting of the baptism of Christ located at the church of Pitumarca in the highland Peruvian province of Canchis presents us with a non-European cast of characters, situated within a distinctly Andean geography (Fig. 6.4).³⁹ Both Christ and St. John can be read as mestizo, with their abundant facial hair (a common visual trope that denoted European ancestry) and light brown skin.⁴⁰ The two figures situated next to Christ, who



FIGURE 6.4 Pablo Gamarra, *Bautismo de Cristo*, mural painting, Church of San Miguel Arcángel de Pitumarca, Canchis Province, Cuzco, Peru, 1777.

PHOTO BY AUTHOR.

39 The church of Pitumarca contains extensive mural decorations along the nave, ceiling, interior arches, lateral chapels, and baptistery. The mural program as a whole has received little scholarly attention; the principal publications on painting and architecture of the colonial Andes grant it only passing reference, if any. For a basic description of the murals, see Mesa and Gisbert, *Historia de la pintura cuzqueña*, 1:243; and Flores Ochoa, Kuon Arce, and Samanez Argumedo, *Pintura mural en el sur andino*, 182–186. Though my consultation of the inventory and account books for Pitumarca at the Archivo Arzobispal in Cuzco, I was able to date and identify the painter of the Baptism of Christ mural. For further discussion, see Ananda Cohen, “Mural Painting and Social Change in the Colonial Andes, 1626–1830” (Ph.D Dissertation, CUNY Graduate Center, 2012), 174–176.

40 For an illuminating discussion on the changing meanings of facial hair during the period of early modern European global expansion, see Elliott Horowitz, “The New World and the Changing Face of Europe,” *Sixteenth Century Journal* 28, no. 4 (1997): 1181–1202.

share a similar physiognomy but lack facial hair, can be read as ethnically indigenous or indigenous descended. These subtle racial designations become more fully apparent if one compares the figures with the whiter, rosy-cheeked figures of St. Peter and St. Paul flanking the scene. Their sandals (often associated with Incas of elite status) and hybrid tunic-like garments with round collars and sleeves tied back to reveal a white undershirt bear loose resemblance to some of the indigenous participants featured in paintings depicting Cuzco's Corpus Christi celebrations and other religious processions in the Andes. Nevertheless, these variations in clothing and physiognomy remain slight, if not indistinguishable.

This painting does not rely on the mutually reinforcing axes of physical appearance and objects as identifiers of race, as we saw in the eschatological imagery. Instead, the depiction of landscape advances a different conceptualization of indigeneity – one that does not merely permeate the depiction of bodies, but instead recalibrates imperial timelines into Andean spatial histories. The extrication of Inca history from the pre-Christian past into damnation's eternal present now follows a different trajectory. A triangular-shaped body of water bisects the scene, filled with fishermen and aquatic animals. The distinctively curved boats woven from *totoras* locate the event not on the shores of the River Jordan, but directly in the Andes, where boats made from this native reed served as the primary mode of transportation across the highland lakes of South America. The immediate reference for Pitumarca residents would have been the nearby lakes fed from the glaciers of Mount Ausangate.⁴¹ But perhaps the most potent symbolic reference with which they would have been familiar was Lake Titicaca, whose significance as a sacred site endured throughout the colonial period, and even into the present day. Lake Titicaca, which straddles the modern-day border between Peru and Bolivia, was regarded as the empire's most significant *pacarina*, or place of origin, as it marked the site from which the Inca's principal gods and founders emerged. Several variants of the Inca origin myth circulated throughout the colonial period through both written accounts and oral tradition. Most standard accounts of the Inca origin story mention Viracocha, the creator god, calling forth the stars, sun, and moon from different islands on Lake Titicaca. The Island of the Sun, which marked the birthplace of Inti, the sun god, was of particular significance for having brought forth Manco Capac and his sister-wife Mama Ocllo, who were the eventual founders of the Inca empire. The residents of Pitumarca, situated en route to Lake Titicaca along the former imperial Collasuyu road that

41 See Andrea M. Heckman, *Woven Stories: Andean Textiles and Rituals* (Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 2003), 98.

linked Cuzco to the Bolivian *altiplano*, would have likely recognized the *totoras* boats and made the association with this impressive lake of origin where such boats were abundant, or with other sacred bodies of water in the region. They may even have identified the two individuals situated next to Christ, who conspicuously lack wings that identified them as angels in most European representations of the scene, as Manco Capac and Mama Ocllo themselves. Lake Titicaca thus becomes resituated as a site of dual origins, a place of emergence for the respective founders of the Inca empire and the Christian faith. Rather than defining the Indian through visual strategies of difference and differentiation, indigenous Andeans participate in a realm of sameness. Indigeneity, in this image, becomes normalized.

The year 1777 in which Pablo Gamarra painted the image serves as a key detail for understanding the broader cultural context in which this mural was conceived. The turn of the century ushered in a major regime change with the transfer of imperial power from the Habsburgs to the Bourbons. The Bourbon monarchy gained control over Spain and its colonial possessions in 1700 when King Charles II failed to produce an heir to the throne. In an effort to streamline the colonial bureaucracy and increase profits, the monarchy implemented a series of measures known as the Bourbon Reforms. One of the most devastating economic policies imposed under these reforms was the reinstatement in 1756 of the *repartimiento de mercancías* (also known as the *reparto*), or the forced sale of peninsular goods to indigenous people.⁴² *Corregidores* (local magistrates) would also offer raw materials to indigenous Andeans on credit, and would then pay for the finished product at low rates that incorporated the

42 A discussion of the Bourbon Reforms, the *repartimiento de mercancías*, the prophecies that circulated about the return of the Inca, and a range of other economic and social factors that led to the Tupac Amaru Rebellion is unfortunately beyond the scope of this essay. For a representative sample of studies that touch on these themes, see Alejandro Ortiz Rescaniere, *De Adaneva a Inkari: una visión indígena del Perú* (Lima: Retablo de Papel, 1973); Alfredo Moreno Cebrian, *El corregidor de indios y la economía Peruana del siglo XVIII (los repartos forzosos de mercancías)* (Madrid: Instituto Gonzalo Fernández de Oviedo, 1977); Jorge Hidalgo Lehuéde, "Amarus y cataris: aspectos mesiánicos de la rebelión indígena de 1781 en Cusco, Chayanta, La Paz y Arica," *Chungara: Revista de Antropología Chilena*, 10 (1983): 117–137; Jan Szemiński, "Why Kill the Spaniard? New Perspectives on Andean Insurrectionary Ideology in the 18th Century," in *Resistance, Rebellion and Consciousness in the Andean Peasant World, 18th to 20th Centuries*, ed. Steve J. Stern (Madison: University of Wisconsin Press, 1987), 166–192; Sinclair Thomson, *We Alone Will Rule: Native Andean Politics in the Age of Insurgency* (Madison: University of Wisconsin Press, 2002); and John Robert Fisher, *Bourbon Peru, 1750–1824* (Liverpool: Liverpool University Press, 2003).

interest incurred on the credit.⁴³ Indigenous peasants were expected to pay off their debts through increased participation in the system of rotational labor known as the *mita*, which usually involved backbreaking labor at the dangerous Potosí mines. This new system exploited the already fragile divisions between *corregidores*, *curacas*, and peasant communities.⁴⁴ The subdivision of the southern sector of the Peruvian Viceroyalty in 1776 into the Viceroyalty of Rio de la Plata also resulted in the fragmentation of trade networks, which catapulted these districts into further economic marginalization.⁴⁵

The radically altered economic and political landscape of Peru under the Bourbons dovetailed with the development of several apocalyptic prophecies in the late eighteenth century.⁴⁶ One of the earliest was the widespread belief that the end of the world would occur in 1777. According to the believers of the prophecy, St. Rose of Lima (the patron saint of Lima and the first canonized saint in the Americas) and St. Francisco Solano (1549–1610) predicted that in the “year of three sevens” the Indians would have their kingdom returned to them.⁴⁷ Stories of apocalypse began to materialize into human action. For instance, the *mestizo* Juan de Dios Orcoguaranca staged a failed uprising in Cuzco on January 1, 1777.⁴⁸ Gamarra’s mural thus acquires a potentially subversive reading upon consideration of the precise historical moment in which it was conceived. His restaging of an iconic Biblical scene into a counternarrative of the emergence of the Inca empire may have articulated a shared perception among the region’s indigenous communities of an impending cataclysmic transfer of power. This regime change did not, however, entail a rejection of Christianity, but rather a repositioning of the Catholic faith within an Inca timeline and pantheon. The Christian/whiteness binary becomes decentered in favor of a fully indigenous religiosity that located Christianity’s roots in the Andes.

Tadeo Escalante’s Hell at the Church of Huaró

Some later colonial images subvert the indigenous/sinner binary through the demonization of whiteness. For example, Tadeo Escalante’s 1802 mural of Hell located in the church of Huaró outside of Cuzco is populated entirely by

43 Mark A. Burkholder and Lyman L. Johnson, *Colonial Latin America*, 6th ed. (New York: Oxford University Press, 2008), 143–144.

44 See Charles F. Walker, *Smoldering Ashes: Cuzco and the Creation of a Republican Peru, 1780–1840* (Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 1999), 22–24.

45 Ward Stavig, *The World of Túpac Amaru: Conflict, Community, and Identity in Colonial Peru* (Lincoln, NE: University of Nebraska Press, 1999), 120–121.

46 Thomson, *We Alone Will Rule*, 164.

47 Lehuede, “Amarus y cataris,” 120–122.

48 See Lehuede, “Amarus y cataris,” and Szemiński, “Why Kill the Spaniard?” 179–180.



FIGURE 6.5 Tadeo Escalante, *El infierno*, mural painting, Church of San Juan Bautista de Huaroc, Quispicanchi Province, Cuzco, Peru, 1802.

PHOTO BY AUTHOR.

white-skinned figures (Fig. 6.5).⁴⁹ The dramatic composition features dozens of sinners receiving vicious torments. At the far left of the composition a group of figures burns inside a bubbling cauldron, beaten with spiked clubs while awaiting entry into the roaring maws of a Hell mouth. Among the sexless naked bodies crammed into the cauldron we see an individual wearing a red hat with a wide brim known as a *galero*, likely referring to his status as a cardinal, and another wearing a bishop's mitre. Their pale bodies accentuated by red shadows cast by the flames allude perhaps most strongly to the derogatory Quechua term, *pukakunka*, or 'redneck,' used to describe Spaniards in the eighteenth century.⁵⁰ Both Escalante's image and the development of this kind of

49 For discussion of Tadeo Escalante's murals at the church of Huaroc, see José Uriel García, "Escuela cusqueña de arte colonial. La iglesia de Huaroc," *Revista del Instituto Americano del Arte* 9, no. 11 (1963): 353–376; Macera, "El arte mural cuzqueño," 99; Mesa and Gisbert, *Historia de la pintura cuzqueña*, 1:248–251; and Flores Ochoa, Kuon Arce, and Samanez Argumedo, *Pintura mural en el sur andino*, 142.

50 Thomson, "Was There Race in Colonial Latin America? Identifying Selves and Others in the Insurgent Andes," 83.

racial terminology coincided with a period of great ethnic conflict culminating in the Tupac Amaru Rebellion (1780–1782), an anticolonial rebellion led by José Gabriel Condorcanqui Tupac Amaru, which sought to overthrow Spanish colonialism and implement a re-envisioned Inca empire based on indigenous and mestizo self-rule.

The images of Spaniards suffering the consequences of flagrant sin and vice closely correspond with a literary record that casts them as depraved and degenerate souls living a life devoid of purity. Eighteenth-century texts such as *Representación verdadera* (1748), an anonymous text later attributed to the mestizo author Fray Calixto de San José Túpac Inca, employed derogatory, dehumanizing language toward Spaniards to highlight their hypocrisy in denying indigenous-descended Andeans entry into the priesthood.⁵¹ The Peruvian historian Alberto Flores Galindo argues that the logic of anticolonial insurgency justified the killing of Spaniards as a way of restoring order to a world controlled by heretics and god-hating savages. He states,

This was conquest discourse inverted. Rebel texts referred to them as ‘impious’ or ‘the excommunicated,’ placed them at the edge of humanity, or denied them humanity: Spaniards were the devil incarnate, anti-Christ and *pistacos*, the infernal, evil beings who emerged only to steal fat or blood. One document stated that *corregidores* “come to suck and take advantage of blood and sweat.”⁵²

In the rebel Andean imaginary, Spaniards become personified as sub-human, demonic creatures. What we see here is a deliberate appropriation of the tropes used for the justification of indigenous evangelization in the sixteenth and seventeenth centuries to vindicate the eradication of colonial rule. The ‘redneck’ *pukakunkas* that defeated Tupac Amaru’s rebel forces now take the place of their Inca counterparts, subjected to an inversion of the same racialized discourse. Throughout the composition, visual markers of Spanish legal and ecclesiastical culture – bishops’s mitres, a stack of papers and a feather quill clutched by the hanging man to the far right of the composition – work in concert with their enflamed white skin to construct a new kind of racialized sin, one in which whiteness becomes marked as ‘other.’

⁵¹ Dueñas, *Indians and Mestizos in the Lettered City*, 205.

⁵² Alberto Flores Galindo, *In Search of an Inca: Identity and Utopia in the Andes*, ed. Carlos Aguirre, Charles F. Walker, and Willie Hiatt (Cambridge and New York: Cambridge University Press, 2010), 101.

Representations of race in colonial Andean paintings often adhered to a prescribed set of compositional formulas. As these images have shown, race became most marked when rendered within the context of sin. We have also seen the vital role that dress and accessories play, in addition to skin color and physiognomy, in the visual construction of racial identity. Whiteness and brownness functioned as relational categories whose mutually defined meanings were constantly undergoing reconfiguration. In the seventeenth-century images described above, sin was defined by one's proximity to indigenous culture, defined loosely through a set of key objects: tunics, musical instruments, headdresses, and drinking vessels. These indices of identity, however, eventually lost traction in favor of later images that sought to universalize indigeneity and particularize Spanishness. The examples described here all rely on a set of frames for making race visible. In other words, the representation of race in Andean visual culture was never isolated from the context of colonialism or religion. Representations of Incas committing acts of idolatry or engaging in inappropriate behaviors served as a mechanism in the evangelizing project to enable indigenous people to see the consequences of their own supposed transgressions. They also gave visual form to a racialized sin that relied on a conceptual fusion of skin, act, and object. Indigenous identity and idolatrous practice became mutually defining markers that manifested themselves on the picture plane through an almost formulaic assortment of symbols and visual strategies. Whiteness could also be associated with sin, but it was devoid of the same apparatus of material and physiognomic qualifiers. The Pitumarca image, on the other hand, excludes whiteness altogether while Tadeo Escalante's mural at Huaro imagery focuses exclusively on it in his depiction of Hell. Both of these murals invert the racial constructions of the earlier images in the service of anticolonial agendas during a period of social upheaval and its protracted aftermath. The placement of brown and white bodies in different eschatological configurations revealed an attempt to harness race into a higher moral order that justified peoples' lived experience within an uneven spectrum of power. At the same time that these images grappled with the representation of race, they also confronted the very system through which race was given meaning and potency. Visual culture may have served as a blunt tool for rendering a complex set of identities in the colonial Andes, but what it does manage to reveal – the codification of racial tropes, the depiction of material culture to signify racialized moral transgression, or the centering and decentering of whiteness – can tell us multitudes about the second lives of Peru's colonial subjects within a racialized religious imaginary.